

**Council Minutes
Forty-Fifth Meeting**

meeting at

Rohthem Presbyterian Church

1759 W Broadway, Anaheim, California

November 12, 2019, 2:00 PM – November 14, 2019, 12:00 Noon

ARTICLE 1 CALL TO ORDER

The 45th annual meeting of NAPARC is convened at Rohthem Presbyterian Church (KPCA - Kosin) on Tuesday, November 12, 2019. The Chairman, Rev. Dr. David Kim, calls the meeting to order at 2:00 p.m. and welcomes the delegates, observers, and visitors. He reads Ephesians 4:15-16 and he leads in prayer. Rev. James Suh of the host congregation makes announcements regarding meals and meeting rooms.

ARTICLE 2 ROLL CALL

A. Member Churches

The Chairman calls upon the delegates to introduce themselves. The following are present.

MEMBER CHURCH	DELEGATES
Associate Reformed Presbyterian Church (ARPC)	Rev. Bill Barron Rev. Kent Moorlach Rev. Soku (Seth) Yi
Canadian Reformed Churches (CanRC)	Mr. Les Vanderveen Rev. Dr. Jeff Temple Rev Steve Vandavelde Mr. Gerrit Bos
Reformed Church of Quebec / Église réformée du Québec (ERQ)	Rev. Karis Mpindi
Free Reformed Churches of North America (FRCNA)	Rev. Jack Schoeman Rev. John Koopman
Heritage Reformed Congregations (HRC)	Rev. Mark Kelderman Mr. James Beeke Mr. Corney Les
Korean American Presbyterian Church (KAPC)	Dr. S. Steve Park Rev. Soo-Chul Yang
Korean Presbyterian Church in America (Kosin) (KPCA)	Rev. Dr. David Kim Rev. Barnabas Jung Rev. Dr. John Song Rev. Young Woo (Tues.) Rev. Joseph Park (Wed.&Thur.)
Orthodox Presbyterian Church (OPC)	Mr. Mark T. Bube Dr. L. Anthony Curto
Presbyterian Church in America (PCA)	Rev. Bryce Hales
Presbyterian Reformed Church (PresRC)	(no delegate this year)
Reformed Church in the United States (RCUS)	Rev. Michael McGee Rev. Jim Sawtelle Mr. Dennis Luquette Mr. Ryan Spitzer
Reformed Presbyterian Church in North America (RPCNA)	Rev. J. Bruce Martin Rev. Bruce R. Backensto Mr. Dean McHenry Rev. Bruce Parnell

United Reformed Churches in North America (URCNA)	Rev. Todd De Rooy Rev. Bradley Lenzner Rev. Daniel Ventura Rev. John Bouwers
---	---

B. Official Observers

The Chairman calls the roll of observer churches. The delegates from each church introduce themselves.

OBSERVER CHURCH	OBSERVERS
Protestant Reformed Churches in America (PRCA)	Rev. Bill Bruinsma Rev. Ken Koole
Bible Presbyterian Church (BPC)	Rev. Dr. Kevin M. Backus Rev. Tito Lyro

ARTICLE 3 APPROVAL OF MINUTES (2018)

Recommendation 1 of the Interim Committee is taken up and seconded. It recommends that the minutes of the 2018 NAPARC Council be approved with the following correction: Mrs. Butterfield’s first name is Rosaria, not Rosanne (Art. 13.A.2.e). The motion is adopted.

ARTICLE 4 COMMUNICATIONS (INCLUDING REPORT OF THE INTERIM COMMITTEE)

A. The following communications have been received.

1. NAPARC 2019 Delegate and Observer information was received from all churches and published with the Council Docket with the exception of a late appointment of the PCA delegate.
2. Church Reports for 2019 were received (*Bylaws* III.2.c) from all churches and published with the Council Docket.
3. The Foreign Mission Consultation report was received from Mr. Mark Bube and published with the Council Docket.
4. The Website Committee Report was received on time (*Bylaws* III.2.c) and published with the Council Docket. See item VIII below for action.

B. The report of the Interim Committee from earlier today is received. It contains the following recommendations which it adopted and recommends to the Council for inclusion in the docket.

1. The Interim Committee recommends to the Council that the 2018 Council Minutes be approved with one correction: the first name of Mrs. Butterfield is Rosaria (Art. 13.A.2.e).
2. The Interim Committee approves the Treasurer’s Report and recommends the Treasurer’s Report to the Council for adoption.
3. The Interim Committee recommends that the budget presented by the Treasurer be approved.
4. The Interim Committee approves the work of the Website Committee and their budget request for \$350 and recommends them to the Council for approval.
5. The Interim Committee recommends that the Council appoint Patrick Malphrus (in place of Lee Shelnut) and Drew Gordon (in place of Bruce Parnell) to the Website Committee
6. The Interim Committee approves the *Question and Prayer Assignment Proposal* and recommends it to the Council for adoption.
7. The Interim Committee recommends for discussion the following topics gleaned from this year’s church reports: [To be taken up under New Business]

ARPC: *What is the current stance within NAPARC on organic union?*

HRC: *As we are and will be dealing with an increasing number of issues and cases regarding such topics as human sexuality; marriage, divorce and remarriage; LGBTQ issues; pornography, gender identification, etc., would it be helpful to create a NAPARC*

depository to share any denominational position papers or committee reports or other publications dealing with these issues?

OPC: *(Carryover from 2018) The wisdom, propriety, and utility of a linguistic updating of Confessional Standards*

8. The Interim Committee recommends that the following be discussed at next year's meeting under new business but allowing the RPCNA delegates to introduce the topic in this year. The Secretary has also been instructed to include a reminder of this in the First Notice (sent around the end of August) along with any information or reports from member churches on the topic which are forwarded to him in the interim.

Should denominations seek to be established within national boundaries? E.g. the RPCNA has presbyteries in two nations outside North America and has two nations represented in North America. The overseas presbyteries are being asked to work toward their own denominations; also, Canadian churches are exploring becoming a separate denomination. Two considerations: 1. Having a view toward global missions that would likely interact with areas of missiology and the role of the visible church to establish new fields and to ordain new officers; 2. Having a view to North American churches that span national boundaries, especially Canada currently and possibly Mexico in the future.

9. The Interim Committee recommends the following slate of officers to be elected:
 - a. Chairman – Rev. Dr. L. Anthony Curto (OPC)
 - b. Vice-Chairman – Rev. Bryce Hales (PCA)
 - c. Secretary – Rev. Ralph Pontier
 - d. Treasurer – Rev. Todd De Rooy
10. The Interim Committee recommends that the Council Docket including these recommendations be adopted.

ARTICLE 6 ADOPTION OF THE DOCKET

Recommendation 10 of the Interim Committee to approve the docket is taken up and supported. The recommendation is adopted.

ARTICLE 7 ELECTION OF OFFICERS

- A. Recommendation 9 of the Interim Committee to elect a slate of officers is taken up. The entire slate is elected.
- B. The following are elected as officers for the coming year.
 1. Chairman – Rev. Dr. L. Anthony Curto of the OPC
 2. Vice-Chairman – Rev. Bryce Hales of the PCA
 3. Secretary – Rev. Ralph Pontier
 4. Treasurer – Rev. Todd De Rooy
- C. Rev. Dr. L. Anthony Curto assumes the chair.

ARTICLE 8 ANNOUNCEMENT OF ADDITIONAL DELEGATES APPOINTED TO THE INTERIM COMMITTEE

In anticipation that current members of the Interim Committee may plan to be replaced before the next Council, the following are appointed to the Interim Committee to replace those presently serving. There are None.

ARTICLE 9 REPORTS FROM MEMBER CHURCHES

- A. Recommendation 6 of the Interim Committee to approve the *Question and Prayer Assignment Proposals* is taken up and seconded. The schedule, as distributed with the Docket, is adopted.
- B. The Chairman calls upon each Member Church to give its report which is followed by questions from the appointed questioner, questions from the floor, and by prayer.

The Reporter	The Questioner and the One Who Prays
ARPC – Rev. Bill Barron	BPC – Rev. Tito Lyro
CanRC – Rev. Steve Vandavelde	PRCNA – Rev. K. Koole & Rev. B. Bruinsma
ERQ – Rev. Karis Mpindi	URCNA – Rev. Bradley Lenzner
FRCNA – Rev. Jack Schoeman	RPCNA – Rev. B. Backensto & Mr. D. McHenry
HRC – Mr. Jim Beeke	RCUS – Rev. Jim Sawtelle
KAPC – Rev. Dr. S. Steve Park	PCA – Rev. Bryce Hales
KPCA – Kosin – Rev. Dr. John Song	OPC – Mr. Mark Bube

- C. The Council recesses for supper. Rev. Tito Lyro leads in prayer. The host church serves a delicious meal of Korean food. The delegates, guests, and visitors gather for a devotional service with Rev. Barnabas Jung presiding and with Rev. Dr. John Song preaching. His text is 1 Thessalonians 1:1-3 on the theme of “Life in Christ: works of faith, labors of love, and endurance of hope. He brings to our attention the “Barna Risk Metrics” (easily found on-line) which indicate risk levels for pastoral burnout.
- D. The Council reconvenes at 10:00 am Wednesday morning. The Chairman reads Ephesians 4:1-16 and invites Rev. Dr. Kevin Backus to lead in prayer.
- E. The reports of the Member Churches continue.

The Reporter	The Questioner Who Also Prays
OPC – Mr. Mark Bube	KPCA – Rev. Dr. David Kim
PCA – Rev. Bryce Hales	KAPC – Rev. Dr. S. Steve Park
RCUS – Rev. Michael McGee	HRC – Rev. Mark Kelderman
RPCNA – Rev. J. Bruce Martin	FRCNA – Rev. John Koopman

- F. The assembly breaks for lunch and reconvenes at 2:00 p.m. At the request of the chairman, Rev. Bruce Parnell opens in prayer. The reports from the Member Churches are concluded with one more report.

The Reporter	The Questioner Who Also Prays
URCNA – Rev. Daniel Ventura	ERQ – Rev. Karis Mpindi

ARTICLE 10 REPORTS FROM OFFICIAL OBSERVER CHURCHES

The Chairman calls upon each invited Observer Church to give a report which is followed by questions from the appointed questioner, from the floor, and by prayer.

The Reporter	The Questioner Who Also Prays
PRCA – Rev. Ken Koole	CanRC – Rev. Dr. Jeff Temple
BPC – Rev. Dr. Kevin M. Backus	ARPC – Rev. Kent Moorlach

ARTICLE 11 DISCUSSION REGARDING PROGRESS TOWARD ORGANIC UNION (AS PROPOSED BY THE INTERIM COMMITTEE)

Nothing has been proposed.

ARTICLE 12 FINANCIAL MATTERS (TREASURER'S REPORT, BUDGET, AND AUDITORS' REPORT)

- A. Interim Committee Recommendation 2 to consider the Treasurer’s Report for adoption is taken up.
1. The Treasurer reads his report and answers questions.
 2. The recommendation to adopt the Treasurer’s Report is adopted.
- B. Interim Committee Recommendation 3 that the Treasurer’s budget be approved is taken up.

1. The Treasurer explains the budget and answers questions. The dues remain the same at \$1,000US per Member Church.
 2. The recommendation to approve the budget is adopted.
- C. The Internal Audit Committee (last year's Chairman and Vice-Chairman) report that the financial records are in good order. It is moved and supported to approve the internal review of the treasurer's records by the Chairman and Vice Chairman. The motion is adopted.
- D. A brief afternoon break is taken. Upon returning, at the request of the chairman, Rev. Mark Kelderman leads in prayer.

ARTICLE 13 REPORTS AND APPOINTMENTS OF OPERATING COMMITTEES

- A. Interim Committee Recommendation 4 to approve the work of the Website Committee and approve their budget request is taken up.
1. Mr. Mark Bube, Chairman of the Website Committee, presents the committee's report and request for a budget of \$350.
 2. The recommendation to approve the Website Committee's work and budget is adopted.
- B. Interim Committee Recommendation 5 is taken up. The Interim Committee recommends that the Council appoint Patrick Malphrus (in place of Lee Shelnutt) and Drew Gordon (in place of Bruce Parnell) to the Website Committee. The recommendation is adopted.

ARTICLE 14 OLD BUSINESS

- A. Reports on three consultations authorized by the 2017 Council which had not yet taken place by the 2018 Council meeting.
1. Theological Education – no report. However, the ICRC is planning something similar for August 25-26, 2020 in Grand Rapids, MI at Puritan Reformed Seminary where all seminaries affiliated with the ICRC are invited to participate (about 20 seminaries from which ICRC churches draw ministers – a list approved by the ICRC member churches).
 2. Diaconal Ministries – this took place by meeting jointly with the World Missions Consultation in September 2019. They plan to do a joint meeting again next year.
 3. Youth Ministries – no report

ARTICLE 15 REPORTS OF STUDY COMMITTEES (NONE)

ARTICLE 16 REPORTS OF CONFERENCES (NONE)

ARTICLE 17 REPORTS ON CONSULTATIONS (AND, WHERE CONVENIENT, APPOINTMENT OF HOST AND CONVENER FOR NEXT CONSULTATION)

- A. World Missions
1. Mr. Mark Bube presents the report which was attached to the Docket (page 65) and answers questions.
 2. The next World Missions Consultation is scheduled for September 15-16, 2020, in Willow Grove, Pennsylvania, with Mr. Bube as the chairman and the Rev. Douglas B. Clawson as the secretary. It is scheduled to be a joint consultation with diaconal representatives. The diaconal consultation will be chaired by Mr. David P. Nakhla.
- B. Christian/Church Education – none
- C. Relief/Diaconal Ministries – none
- D. Theological Training – none
- E. Youth Ministries – none

ARTICLE 18 ARRANGEMENTS FOR THE NEXT (2020) MEETING

- A. The next scheduled host (in the alpha listing) is Orthodox Presbyterian Church.
- B. Place: the Shiloh OPC in Raleigh North Carolina

- C. Date: Second Tuesday of November (*Bylaws I.1*): November 10-12, 2020
- D. Invitees: The Interim Committee has approved inviting official observers from the National Presbyterian Church of Mexico, the Protestant Reformed Churches in America, and the Bible Presbyterian Church.

ARTICLE 19 NEW BUSINESS

- A. Recommendation 7 of the Interim Committee is taken up and adopted. Discussion is held on the following three topics.

1. ARPC: *What is the current stance within NAPARC on organic union?*

Speaker 1 recalls the National Presbyterian and Reformed Fellowship which preceded NAPARC and the joining and receiving of the PCA and the RPCES. He urges the body to continue to be about organic unity.

Speaker 2 says that his federation has always pushed for organic unity but recognizes that it must be a long-term goal that takes patience and much preparation, like preparing for marriage. We have to learn to do it better.

Speaker 3 asks the ARP why they ask the question. A representative from the ARP responds that they recognize organic unity is one of the primary purposes of NAPARC but it is not happening and so they are asking, “why are we in NAPARC?”. **Speaker 3** responds that five to seven years ago significant discussions took place on organic unity which are summarized in NAPARC’s *Informational Documents* (available on the NAPARC website) which contain a definition of organic union and an essay on the pursuit of organic unity. NAPARC was also changed at that time to allow an extra day (more time) for bi-lateral meetings where significant progress can and has been made toward the goal of unity.

Speaker 4 relates what a tremendous blessing it has been for him to attend NAPARC this year and the last two years. He has learned much about the Member Churches, gaining a greater appreciation for them, and has seen progress in several Member Churches moving to higher levels of contact with each other.

Speaker 5 relates that NAPARC helps with pulpit supply and in some instances allows ministers to administer sacraments in each other’s churches.

Speaker 6 emphasizes the need to educate our people on the biblical mandate for ecumenicity and unity (e.g. John 17). It should be a topic for preaching, for example on Pentecost. He recommends a book by Puritan author, Anthony Burgess, *Advancing Christian Unity* (Reformation Heritage Books, 2019).

Speaker 7 he suggests that the Secretary distribute the 2012 report of the Committee of Review which contains a history of NAPARC and much on organic unity.

- It is moved and supported to instruct the Secretary to send a copy of the 2012 Committee of Review report to the delegates. The motion is adopted. [Note: it was distributed that evening.]

Speaker 8 notes that there has been substantial progress over the many years of NAPARC and much for which to be thankful.

Speaker 9 says that one of the biggest blessings of NAPARC is to see how the Gospel unites us all despite all our different practices.

Speaker 10 reflects on his work as a missionary and on John 17 and on Chapter 25 of the Westminster Confession on the nature of the church, both invisible and visible. It is at the level of the visible church that we talk about organic unity. He suggests that the unity of the Spirit is a kind of organic unity and that what we are talking about here is better called structural unity. Because of the unity of the Spirit, we should strive for structural unity. We should be willing to let go of many of our practices that are not demanded by Scripture – that are not necessary. We should repent of what needs to be repented of and work together in as many areas as possible.

Speaker 3 speaks again to agree that the unity of the Spirit is a type of organic unity but reminds us that our *Informational Documents* define organic unity not in that way but as what the previous

speaker calls structural unity. Therefore, when we use the phrase “organic unity” we must be careful to distinguish what we mean for it has been defined differently in different contexts.

- B. At the request of the chairman, Mr. Gerrit Bos closes the afternoon session with prayer.
- C. The delegates, observers, and other guests enjoy a delicious meal at the Fullerton Hotel. After dinner, Rev. Dr. David Kim speaks on the history of the Kosin denomination in Korea and in North America.
- D. The assembly reconvenes at 10:00 am on Thursday. The chairman opens by reading 2 Corinthians 4:1-6 and he invites Rev. John Bouwers to lead in prayer. The discussion of topics approved by the Interim Committee continues.

- 1. *HRC: As we are and will be dealing with an increasing number of issues and cases regarding such topics as human sexuality; marriage, divorce and remarriage; LGBTQ issues; pornography, gender identification, etc., would it be helpful to create a NAPARC depository to share any denominational position papers or committee reports or other publications dealing with these issues?*

Speaker 1 makes reference to the fact that there are a number of papers in existence but not readily available in one place, therefore they bring the request to us.

Speaker 2 makes reference to the 2012 Committee of Review, page 9.D. which calls for the very thing for which the HRC is asking only regarding all subjects not just on one topic.

Speaker 3 warns against putting on the website that which might unnecessarily make us a target of cultural backlash.

- *It is moved and supported to instruct the Secretary to solicit from the member churches what each member church has produced on human sexuality, marriage, divorce and remarriage; LGBTQ issues; pornography, gender identification, etc., and distribute a list of those resources and where they can be found or purchased. The motion is adopted.*
- 2. *OPC: (Carryover from 2018) The wisdom, propriety, and utility of a linguistic updating of Confessional Standards*

Speaker 1 says that at most they are considering morphological changes of pronouns and a change of a very view obsolete or archaic words. One of their main concerns now is to confer with sister churches because the confessions are the basis of ecumenical relations.

Speaker 2 says that the RPCNA has responded officially to the OPC. The response is read. The response gives both encouragement and expresses some caution. The response includes a suggestion that no changes be made but instead a modern confession be developed to be held in addition to the original confession or that footnotes be added for obsolete or archaic language.

Speaker 3 asks if other churches have done anything similar with their confessions.

Speaker 4 says that the FRC intends to update their confessions, as the CanRC and the URC have done in the past, but those changes have not been a hinderance to ecumenical relations.

Speaker 3 says that one concern the OPC has is that the changes will not affect them adversely in their own subscription to the confession as well as how it might affect fraternal relations.

Speaker 5 says that the Chinese translation of the Westminster Confession is not always as identical as many would hope.

Speaker 6 suggests that a modern translation be a subordinate document.

Speaker 1 says the OPC already has a modern, subordinate document.

Speaker 3 expresses the fear that a modern translation might not be able to support all that has been built on the original foundation. There is a need for an update, but the big question is how to do it and be faithful to the faith. Thus, the question seeking wisdom of the brothers.

Speaker 7 suggests that the work could be done jointly with other denominations or federations.

Speaker 8 says that there is no such thing as a perfect translation when translating from one language to another and we need to learn to live with that.

Speaker 9 A common confession does not necessarily mean that we all interpret the confession the same. We live with that and should not fear it.

Speaker 10 encourages the OPC not only to consider how changes might affect fraternal relations but also how it might unintentionally affect churches within the OPC. In another denomination, where a Scriptural reference was changed, trials ensued.

- E. Recommendation 8 of the Interim Committee is taken up and adopted. The RPCNA delegates introduce the following topic for discussion next year:

Should denominations seek to be established within national boundaries? E.g. the RPCNA has presbyteries in two nations outside North America and has two nations represented in North America. The overseas presbyteries are being asked to work toward their own denominations; also, Canadian churches are exploring becoming a separate denomination. Two considerations: 1. Having a view toward global missions that would likely interact with areas of missiology and the role of the visible church to establish new fields and to ordain new officers; 2. Having a view to North American churches that span national boundaries, especially Canada currently and possibly Mexico in the future.

A speaker from the RPCNA says that they have been pushing their presbytery in Japan to become a separate denomination rather than remain a presbytery of the RPCNA. They are also concerned about China and Canada. He asks if this is a fracturing of the church or is it good for the development of the church. Will this aid, for example, the RPCNA in Canada and the ARPC in Canada to move closer together than they are now? That is another concern behind this question.

ARTICLE 20 ADJOURNMENT

- A. A motion is made and supported to adjourn. The motion is adopted at 11:03 a.m.
B. The Chairman leads in closing prayer.

Respectfully submitted,
Rev. Ralph A. Pontier
Secretary